



SDI Review Form 1.6

Journal Name:	British Microbiology Research Journal
Manuscript Number:	2013_BMRJ_6433
Title of the Manuscript:	Prevalence and Molecular Diversity of <i>Legionella pneumophila</i> in Domestic Hot Water Systems of Private Houses
Type of the Article	Research Paper

General guideline for Peer Review process:

This journal's peer review policy states that **NO** manuscript should be rejected only on the basis of '**lack of Novelty**', provided the manuscript is scientifically robust and technically sound.

To know the complete guideline for Peer Review process, reviewers are requested to visit this link:

(<http://www.sciencedomain.org/page.php?id=sdi-general-editorial-policy#Peer-Review-Guideline>)



SDI Review Form 1.6

PART 1: Review Comments

	Reviewer's comment	Author's comment (if agreed with reviewer, correct the manuscript and highlight that part in the manuscript. It is mandatory that authors should write his/her feedback here)
Compulsory REVISION comments	1. Grammar and writing should be improved throughout, there are many errors in the current version that should be corrected by more careful editing. 2. No statistics are provided for comparisons that resulted in conclusions. In all cases statistics should be provided in the text for conclusions and, if possible, also provided in tables/figures. Methods used should also be provided. In the absence of statistics conclusions should be deleted. 3. The significance of a correlation with temperature has not been demonstrated. Statistics would make this conclusion accurate, if supported by the statistics. 4. Reference to travel-associated infections (Conclusions) is inappropriate, considering that residence water supplies were evaluated. Travel-associated infections could only be addressed by looking at hotel water systems, which have very different engineering and construction specifications. 5. RAPD-PCR is not defined in Fig. 2 and it should be. 6. Line 147. 'sensitized' is not the correct word here, possibly the authors mean 'linked to' (deleting with).	As advised by the reviewer, the manuscript was sent to Dr Eric R. Dabbs, (A British national and a dear colleague of the authors) working at the School of Molecular and Cell Biology, University of the Witwatersrand, South Africa, for English proofreading. In this manuscript there is no doubt that, one of the limitations in this study, was the small number of the total <i>L. pneumophila</i> isolates, these results forced us to use simple statistics that were expressed using cross-tabulation as both number and percentage for the categorized data only as shown in table 1. The significant correlation with temperature has been analyzed and evaluated through a well-proven computer-assisted data analysis system (Gelcompar II software, Applied Maths, Kortjik, Belgium), using a specific similarity matrix represented in percent similarity through the scale at the top of figure 2. and that's why the authors did not see the need to support their findings with further statistics. Regarding the reference to travel-associated infections in the conclusion part as mentioned by the authors "studies should be conducted to include other cities and other water systems in



SDI Review Form 1.6

		the whole middle eastern area in order to give us a clear image about the prevalence of <i>Legionella</i> and further try to develop an international legislation and prevention measures to aid in reducing the <i>Legionella</i> related pneumonia cases” the bold highlighted statement made by the authors was addressed to looking at hotels, hospitals, spas,.....etc. water systems in future work which will be related to Travel-associated infections Figure 2: was generated by Gelcompar II software and the dendrogram represents the RAPD-PCR gel band patterns of the same <i>Legionella</i> isolates typed with primer OP-A3 in figure 1, with the isolate numbers and genotypes listed to the right of the figure and correspond to those in figure 1. Regarding the word sensitized it was written according to the manufacturer’s protocol and as cited in the following reference: “Chaabna Z, Forey F, Reyrolle M, Jarraud S, Atlan D, Fontvieille D, Gilbert C. Molecular diversity and high virulence of <i>Legionella pneumophila</i> strains isolated from biofilms developed within a warm spring of a thermal spa. BMC Microbiol. 2013;13:17”
--	--	--



SDI Review Form 1.6

<u>Minor</u> REVISION comments		
<u>Optional/General</u> comments	Only with conclusions that are currently not well justified. Statistics are needed to draw conclusions.	As mentioned before our findings may be useful as baseline information on the colonization of the water heating systems of private houses, and the results observed in this study should be viewed with concern and necessitates continuous monitoring through similar surveillance studies besides trying to put more effort in providing better statistical analysis future work.